



Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru **The National Assembly for Wales**

Y Pwyllgor Cymunedau, Cydraddoldeb a **Llywodraeth Leol** **The Communities, Equality and Local Government** **Committee**

Dydd Mercher, 4 Rhagfyr 2013
Wednesday, 4 December 2013

Cynnwys **Contents**

Cyflwyniadau, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon
Introductions, Apologies and Substitutions

Trafod Materion sy'n Ymwneud â'r Iaith Gymraeg—Sesiwn Dystiolaeth â'r Prif Weinidog
Consideration of Matters Relating to the Welsh Language—Evidence Session with the First
Minister

Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42 i Benderfynu Gwahardd y Cyhoedd
Motion Under Standing Order 17.42 to Resolve to Exclude the Public

Cofnodir y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y pwyllgor. Yn ogystal, cynhwysir
trawsgrifiad o'r cyfieithu ar y pryd.

The proceedings are reported in the language in which they were spoken in the committee. In
addition, a transcription of the simultaneous interpretation is included.

Aelodau'r pwyllgor yn bresennol
Committee members in attendance

Leighton Andrews	Llafur Labour
Peter Black	Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru Welsh Liberal Democrats
Christine Chapman	Llafur (Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor) Labour (Committee Chair)
Janet Finch-Saunders	Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives
Mike Hedges	Llafur Labour
Mark Isherwood	Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives
Gwyn R. Price	Llafur Labour
Jenny Rathbone	Llafur Labour
Rhodri Glyn Thomas	Plaid Cymru The Party of Wales
Simon Thomas	Plaid Cymru (yn dirprwyo ar ran Jocelyn Davies) The Party of Wales (substitute for Jocelyn Davies)

Eraill yn bresennol
Others in attendance

Carwyn Jones	Aelod Cynulliad, Llafur (Prif Weinidog Cymru) Assembly Member, Labour (The First Minister of Wales)
Dr Caroline Turner	Dirprwy Gyfarwyddwr, yr Iaith Gymraeg, Llywodraeth Cymru Deputy Director, Welsh Language, Welsh Government

Swyddogion Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn bresennol
National Assembly for Wales officials in attendance

Sarah Beasley	Clerc Clerk
Leanne Hatcher	Dirprwy Glerc Deputy Clerk
Rhys Iorwerth	Y Gwasanaeth Ymchwil Research Service

Dechreuodd y cyfarfod am 09:30.
The meeting began at 09:30.

Cyflwyniadau, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon
Introductions, Apologies and Substitutions

[1] **Christine Chapman:** Bore da and welcome to the Assembly's Communities, Equality and Local Government Committee. I remind Members that if they have any mobile phones, they should ensure that they are switched off, as they affect the transmission. We have had an apology this morning from Jocelyn Davies, and Simon Thomas is substituting. Welcome, Simon.

09:31

Trafod Materion sy'n Ymwneud â'r Iaith Gymraeg—Sesiwn Dystiolaeth â'r Prif Weinidog

Consideration of Matters Relating to the Welsh Language—Evidence Session with the First Minister

[2] **Christine Chapman:** I welcome Carwyn Jones AM, First Minister. I also welcome Dr Caroline Turner, deputy director Welsh language, Welsh Government. Welcome to you both. First Minister, you have provided a paper in advance, so we will go straight into questions. I will start off. Could you comment on the extent to which the progress report on 'A Living Language: A Language for Living', which is due shortly, will show that the Welsh Government is succeeding in its commitment to increase the number of Welsh speakers in Wales?

[3] **The First Minister (Carwyn Jones):** Our Welsh language strategy is clearly an important strategy for us; that goes without saying. It is the main strategy through which we would seek to deliver an increase in not just the number of Welsh speakers, but the number of confident Welsh speakers in the future. We will be publishing our annual report soon. That is in relation to the progress of the 2012-17 strategy. That report will be published at the end of this year. It will contain a number of items detailing what we have done in a number of areas in terms of increasing the use of the language.

[4] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Rwyf am droi at y gynhadledd fawr, a gynhaliwyd ym mis Gorffennaf yn Aberystwyth yn dilyn proses o ymgynghori. Codwyd nifer o bwyntiau yn y gynhadledd ac, yn dilyn y gynhadledd, cafwyd y camau gweithredu gan Lywodraeth Cymru. Beth yw eich ymateb chi i'r feirniadaeth sydd wedi bod nad oes fawr sy'n newydd yn y camau gweithredu ac nad ydynt mewn gwirionedd yn mynd i'r afael â'r her fawr sy'n ein hwynebu ni o ran dyfodol yr iaith Gymraeg?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I will turn to the 'cynhadledd fawr' that was held in July in Aberystwyth, following a process of consultation. A number of points were raised in the conference and, following the conference, we had actions from the Welsh Government. What is your response to the criticism that there is not much new in those actions and that they do not really address the big challenge that faces us in terms of the future of the Welsh language?

[5] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Rhaid inni sylweddoli taw dechrau'r broses yw hyn. Nid wyf erioed wedi dweud bod y broses o weithredu ar ôl y gynhadledd fawr wedi gorffen—dim o'r fath beth. Rwyf wedi dweud y bydd datganiad arall yn dod yn y flwyddyn newydd ynglŷn â sicrhau bod Aelodau'n gwybod beth sydd ar y gweill yn y dyfodol a beth sydd wedi cael ei wneud hyd yn hyn. Rydym wedi gwneud pethau ers hynny. Rydym wedi gweithredu yn y maes addysg, er enghraifft rydym wedi lansio'r ymgyrch i annog rhieni sydd yn mo'yn cael addysg Gymraeg i'w plant. Rydym wedi symud ymlaen ynglŷn â sgiliau yn y gweithle a'r ddarpariaeth sydd ar gael ar gyfer pobl ifanc. Rydym yn symud ymlaen ynglŷn â thechnoleg, yn enwedig yr arian a fydd ar

The First Minister: We have to bear in mind that this is the beginning of the process. I have never said that the process of acting after the 'cynhadledd fawr' is finished—far from it. There will be another statement in the new year in terms of ensuring that Members are aware of what is in the pipeline for the future and what has been done to date. We have done many things since then. We have taken action on education, for example we have launched the campaign to encourage parents who want their children to have a Welsh-medium education. We have also moved on in terms of workplace skills and we have made provisions for young people. We have made some steps in terms of technology, particularly the funding available to ensure that, for example, there will be

gael i sicrhau bod mwy o aps, er enghraifft, ar gael yn Gymraeg yn y dyfodol. Rydym hefyd wedi gwneud pethau ymarferol, fel yr ymgyrch pump y dydd, er mwyn sicrhau bod pobl yn defnyddio'r Gymraeg yn y gweithle, sydd wedi bod yn wendid hyd yma. Wrth gwrs, mae yna fwy i'w wneud, felly bydd datganiad pellach yn ystod y flwyddyn nesaf.

[6] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** O ran y cynlluniau technoleg rydych wedi cyfeirio atynt, mae £200,000 wedi'i glustnodi ar gyfer y rheini. A yw hwnnw'n arian newydd?

[7] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hwnnw'n arian sydd wedi cael ei drosglwyddo. Nid yw'n arian newydd.

[8] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** O ran y cynllun gwella, sef y cynllun sy'n ymwneud â'r ymateb gan Lywodraeth Cymru i'r sefyllfa, un o'r argymhellion yw hyn:

[9] 'Bydd y Cynllun Gwella hefyd yn canolbwyntio ar greu systemau ar waith i hwyluso prif ffrydio'r iaith Gymraeg, ac yn galluogi'r Llywodraeth i asesu gwariant yn fwy effeithiol ar yr iaith Gymraeg ar draws portffolios.'

[10] Yr hyn yr ydym wedi'i weld yn y gyllideb, wrth gwrs, yw torri yn ôl sylweddol ar wariant ar y Gymraeg. Mae hynny'n ymddangos braidd yn od o ystyried mai un o'r camau sylfaenol oedd defnyddio'r gwariant ar y Gymraeg yn fwy effeithiol ar draws y portffolios. Mae'r gwariant ar y Gymraeg wedi cael ei dorri yn ôl bron iawn i bob portffolio.

[11] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n wir i ddweud bod gwariant wedi cael ei dorri yn ôl, ond rydym yn ffael gwarechod popeth achos y ffaith bod y toriadau yn dod o du Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig. Fodd bynnag, rwy'n hyderus fod y gyllideb ar gyfer yr iaith Gymraeg yn mynd i hybu'r iaith Gymraeg, ac rwy'n hyderus y bydd gwaith yn cael ei wneud ar draws y portffolios er mwyn hybu'r iaith Gymraeg yn y dyfodol.

[12] Yr hyn sydd hefyd yn bwysig yw sicrhau ein bod yn hybu'r iaith y tu mewn i'r

more apps available in Welsh in the future. There are other practical steps, such as the five-a-day campaign to ensure that people use the Welsh language in the workplace, which has been a weakness up until now. Of course, there is still more to be done, therefore there will be a further statement during the next year.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: In terms of the technology schemes that you have referred to, £200,000 has been earmarked for those. Is that new money?

The First Minister: That is funding that has been transferred. It is not new funding.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: In terms of the improvement plan, which is the plan that relates to the Welsh Government's response to the situation, one of the recommendations is this:

'The Improvement Plan will also focus on putting systems in place to facilitate the mainstreaming the Welsh language, and enable the Government to more effectively assess expenditure on the Welsh language across portfolios.'

What we have seen in the budget, of course, is that there has been a substantial cut in expenditure on the Welsh language. That appears slightly strange considering that one of the fundamental steps was to use the expenditure on the Welsh language more effectively across portfolios. The expenditure on the Welsh language in nearly every portfolio has been cut.

The First Minister: It is true to say that there has been a cut in expenditure, but we cannot safeguard everything because of the fact that the cuts are being imposed by the UK Government. However, I am confident that the budget for the Welsh language will promote the Welsh language, and I am confident that work will be done across portfolios to promote the Welsh language in the future.

What is also important is to ensure that we promote the language within the

Llywodraeth. Rydym wedi apwyntio pencampwyr iaith, er mwyn sicrhau bod yr iaith yn cael ei phrif ffrydio drwyddi draw yng ngwaith y Llywodraeth, ac rydym yn mo'yn sicrhau bod y pencampwyr hynny yn gweld lle mae'r cyfleoedd i ddatblygu'r iaith Gymraeg yn ymarferol yn y Llywodraeth yn y dyfodol.

[13] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Ai swyddogion neu Weinidogion yw'r pencampwyr?

[14] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Swyddogion yw'r pencampwyr. Mae'n bwysig dros ben, wrth gwrs, fod gennym bobl sy'n gweithio fel swyddogion er mwyn hybu'r iaith Gymraeg. Mae pob Gweinidog, wrth gwrs, yn bencampwr dros yr iaith Gymraeg. Mae'n bwysig dros ben bod yna swyddogion sydd hefyd yn dal y swydd honno.

[15] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Roedd y Gweinidog blaenorol a oedd â chyfrifoldeb am yr iaith Gymraeg, sy'n digwydd bod yma'r bore yma fel aelod o'r pwyllgor hwn, yn bwriadu, yn ôl yn yr haf, sefydlu comisiwn i edrych ar y dirywiad sydd wedi bod o ran y nifer sydd yn medru'r Gymraeg yn sir Gaerfyrddin, oherwydd bod y cyfrifiad yn dangos bod y dirywiad yn y fan honno yn fwy nac yn unrhyw le arall. Nid oes sôn wedi bod am y comisiwn hwnnw wedi ymadawiad y Gweinidog.

[16] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r cyngor ei hun wedi sefydlu gweithgor er mwyn edrych yn fanwl ar ganlyniadau'r cyfrifiad. Rydym ni'n mo'yn gweithio gyda'r cyngor er mwyn cynllunio i gryfhau'r sefyllfa yn y dyfodol. Mae'r drafodaeth honno wedi dechrau gyda'r awdurdod, ac, mewn ffordd, mae'r cyngor ei hun wedi dechrau'r broses hon ac rydym ni'n mo'yn sicrhau ein bod yn gweithio gyda'r cyngor yn effeithiol er mwyn symud ymlaen gyda'r gwaith a fyddai unrhyw gomisiwn a sefydlwyd gan Lywodraeth Cymru wedi'i wneud beth bynnag.

[17] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Fodd bynnag, y ffaith amdani yw mai'r cyngor sydd yn gyfrifol am y rhan fwyaf o wasanaethau sy'n allweddol o ran yr iaith Gymraeg o fewn y sir, yn arbennig addysg, a byddai rhai yn dweud mai'r diffygion o ran

Government. We have appointed language champions in order to ensure that the Welsh language is mainstreamed throughout the work of the Government, and we want to ensure that those champions identify opportunities to develop the Welsh language on a practical level within the Government in the future.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Are the champions officials or Ministers?

The First Minister: They are officials. It is very important, of course, that we have officials who are working to promote the Welsh language. Every Minister, of course, is a champion for the Welsh language. It is very important that we also have officials who are taking that role.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: The previous Minister who had responsibility for the Welsh language, who happens to be here this morning as a member of this committee, intended back in the summer to establish a commission to look at the decline that has happened in the number of people who can speak Welsh in Carmarthenshire, because the census showed that the decline there is greater than anywhere else. There has been no mention of that commission since the departure of the Minister.

The First Minister: The council itself has established a working group to look in detail at the census results. We want to work with the council so that we can plan in order to strengthen the situation in the future. That discussion has started with the authority, and, in a way, the council itself has commenced this process and we want to ensure that we work effectively with it in order to progress the work that any Welsh Government-established commission would have carried out in any case.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: However, the fact is that it is the council that is responsible for the majority of key services in terms of the Welsh language within the county, especially education, and some would say that the deficiencies in terms of education in

addysg yn sir Gaerfyrddin sydd yn bennaf gyfrifol am y dirywiad. A yw'r cyngor, mewn gwirionedd, yn mynd i edrych ar ei fethiannau ei hun mewn ffordd feirniadol? Onid dyna oedd y rhesymeg tu ôl cael comisiwn annibynnol a fyddai'n edrych ar y cyngor?

[18] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Bydd yn rhaid i'r cyngor wneud hynny ac, wrth gwrs, i fod yn onest ynglŷn â'r sefyllfa yn sir Gâr, gan gofio'r ffaith ein bod yn siarad am gyfrifiad 10 mlynedd a'r ffaith i sawl plaid fod yn gyfrifol am y weinyddiaeth yn sir Gâr yn ystod yr amser hwnnw.

[19] Fodd bynnag, rwy'n credu bod pethau da wedi digwydd yn sir Gâr. Rydym wedi gweld beth sydd wedi digwydd yng nghwm Gwendraeth ac rydym wedi gweld, er enghraifft, sefyllfa Ysgol Dyffryn Aman yn newid. Felly, mae darpariaeth o ran addysg Gymraeg yn y sir, ond yr hyn sydd yn digwydd yw nad yw pobl yn defnyddio'r iaith yn yr un ffordd ag yr oedden nhw, yn enwedig yn y dwyrain, lle mae bron pob ysgol yn ysgol Gymraeg a lle mae'r ysgol gyfun yn awr yn mynd tuag at fod yn ysgol Gymraeg yn y dyfodol, yn ôl y cynlluniau. Nid yw hynny'n ddigon. Mae'n rhaid inni ystyried pam fod pobl ifanc yn enwedig ddim yn defnyddio'r Gymraeg. Y sialens yw adeiladu ar waith da'r ysgolion Gymraeg.

[20] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Fodd bynnag, y gwir yw bod Ysgol Dyffryn Aman yn eithriad o ran yr ysgolion traddodiadol dwyieithog yn sir Gaerfyrddin ac mae ei pholisi o ran sicrhau bod plant sydd yn dod o ysgolion cynradd categori A yn mynd i mewn i'r ffrwd Gymraeg wedi profi i fod yn llwyddiant mawr ac wedi cael effaith sylweddol ar y modd y mae'r Gymraeg yn cael ei defnyddio o fewn yr ysgol. Fodd bynnag, eithriad yw hynny ac ychydig iawn o ysgolion sydd yn dilyn yr un polisi.

[21] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Rwy'n credu bod pethau yn symud yn y cyfeiriad hwnnw, o ystyried beth yw'r cynlluniau ynglŷn â chwm Gwendraeth, yn enwedig y cynlluniau sydd yno i beth oedd Maes yr Yrfa—rwy'n credu mai Maes y Gwendraeth yw enw'r ysgol.

Carmarthenshire are chiefly responsible for the decline. Is the council really going to look at its own failings in a critical way? Is that not the reasoning behind establishing an independent commission that would look at the council?

The First Minister: The council will have to do that and, of course, be honest as to what the situation is in Carmarthenshire, given the fact that we are talking about a 10-year census and the fact that there were many parties responsible for the administration in Carmarthenshire during that period.

However, I think that positive steps have been taken in Carmarthenshire. We have seen what has happened in the Gwendraeth valley and we have seen, for example, the situation of Amman Valley School shifting. So, there is provision in terms of Welsh-medium education within the county, but the problem is that people do not make use of the language in the same way as they used to, particularly in the east of the county, where almost every school is a Welsh-medium school and where we now have the comprehensive school moving towards being a designated Welsh-medium school in the future, according to the plans. That is not enough. We have to consider why young people in particular do not use the Welsh language. The challenge is to build on the good work of the Welsh-medium schools.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: However, the truth is that Amman Valley School is an exception in terms of the traditional bilingual schools in Carmarthenshire and its policy in terms of ensuring that children who come from category A primary schools go into the Welsh-medium stream has proved to be a big success and has had a substantial impact on the way that the Welsh language is used within the school. However, that is an exception and very few schools follow the same policy.

The First Minister: I think that things are moving in that direction, considering the plans in terms of the Gwendraeth valley, and especially in terms of what was once called Maes yr Yrfa—I believe that the school is now called Maes y Gwendraeth. So, I think

Felly, rwy'n credu bod cynlluniau da yn cael eu sefydlu yn sir Gâr er mwyn hybu'r iaith, yn enwedig yn yr ardaloedd lle mae mwyafrif sylweddol yn siarad yr iaith, ond lle mae cwmp yn y nifer sy'n defnyddio'r iaith ers dros fwy na degawd. Fodd bynnag, mae'n un peth i sicrhau bod plant yn cael addysg yn y Gymraeg, ond mae'n her arall i sicrhau eu bod yn defnyddio'r Gymraeg, yn enwedig tu fas i'r ysgol; er eu bod yn siarad Cymraeg a'u rhieni yn siarad Cymraeg, Saesneg yw'r iaith maent yn ei defnyddio. Ym mha ffordd yr ydym yn sicrhau ein bod yn delio â hynny? Drwy sicrhau bod mwy o weithgareddau ar gael yn Gymraeg tu fas i'r ysgol. Mae'n wir dweud, yn rhai o siroedd y gorllewin, nad oes digon o ddarpariaeth. Rydym wedi clywed yr enghraifft o wersi nofio neu oifad yng Ngheredigion lle nad oes neb ar gael i roi'r gwersi hynny yn y Gymraeg. Mae'n rhaid i hynny newid. Mae'n rhaid inni hefyd sicrhau bod pobl ifanc yn gallu defnyddio technoleg yn y Gymraeg, a dyna pam fod gennym gyllideb er mwyn datblygu *apps* a thechnoleg bellach i bobl ifanc er mwyn iddynt ddod yn gyfarwydd â defnyddio'r Gymraeg yn y byd technoleg, ac nid dim ond yn gymdeithasol neu dim ond yn yr ysgol.

[22] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Rwy'n sylweddoli, Gadeirydd—rwyf wedi edrych ar y cloc—fod gennyf lot o gwestiynau eraill ar y gynhadledd fawr. Gwnaf ofyn un cwestiwn i orffen. Gan taw lleiafrif o boblogaeth sir Gaerfyrddin sy'n siarad Cymraeg erbyn hyn, y cam cyntaf fyddai sicrhau bod pob plentyn yn derbyn addysg gynradd drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yn sir Gaerfyrddin. Byddai hynny'n gam mawr ymlaen. Nid wyf yn anghytuno ynglŷn â'r cyfleoedd y tu allan i'r ysgol. Gyda'r camau cychwynnol hyn rydych wedi eu cyhoeddi—rydych wedi dweud bod mwy i ddod—beth yw'r amserlen ar gyfer y camau cyntaf hyn i sicrhau eu bod i gyd yn eu lle ac yn weithredol?

[23] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Rydym mo'yn sicrhau eu bod mewn lle erbyn dechrau'r flwyddyn nesaf, a bydd datganiad yn ystod tymor nesaf y Cynulliad a fydd yn dangos y gwaith sydd wedi cael ei wneud. Ynglŷn â'r manylion, daw Caroline i mewn.

[24] **Dr Turner:** Ar yr hyn rydym yn ei

that there are positive proposals being progressed in Carmarthenshire to promote the language, particularly in those areas where a significant majority speak the language, but there has been a reduction in the number using the language over a period of more than a decade. However, it is one thing to ensure that children receive Welsh-medium education, but it is another challenge altogether to ensure that they use the Welsh language outside school; although they speak Welsh and their parents speak Welsh, English is the language that they use. How do we ensure that we deal with that? By ensuring that more activities are available through the medium of Welsh outside school. It is true to say that, in some western counties, there is not adequate provision. We have heard about an example of swimming lessons in Ceredigion where there is no-one available to provide those lessons through the medium of Welsh. That has to change. We must also ensure that young people are able to use technology through the medium of Welsh, and that is why we have a budget to develop apps and advanced technology for young people so that they grow used to using the Welsh language in technology, and not just socially or in school.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I realise, Chair—I have looked at the clock—that I have many other questions on the 'cynhadledd fawr'. I will ask one last question. Considering that a minority of Carmarthenshire's population speaks Welsh now, the first step is to ensure that every child receives primary education through the medium of Welsh in Carmarthenshire. That would be a big step forward. I do not disagree about opportunities outside school. With these initial steps that you have announced—you have said that there are more to come—what is the timetable for these initial steps to ensure that they are in place and are implemented?

The First Minister: We want to ensure that they are in place by the beginning of next year, and there will be a statement during the next Assembly term that will demonstrate the work that has been done. On the details, Caroline might come in.

Dr Turner: What we are doing at present is

wneud, mae gennym gryn dipyn o arolygon yn dod i mewn ar hyn o bryd. Mae gennym yr arolwg cymunedau Cymraeg a fydd yn cael ei gyhoeddi yn nes ymlaen heddiw. Hefyd, mae grŵp iaith economi wedi ei sefydlu, ac mae hwnnw bron iawn â chwblhau ei waith yn ôl yr hyn rwy'n ei ddallt. Rydym wedi comisiynu astudiaeth o waith y mentrau a'r gwaith cymunedol hefyd. Felly, rydym eisiau edrych ar hynny i gyd cyn gwneud argymhellion pendant. Byddwn yn edrych ar rheini i gyd dros y gaeaf—dros y Nadolig a'r flwyddyn newydd—a bydd y rheini i gyd yn bwydo i mewn i ddatganiad pellach a mwy manwl, a strategaeth efallai'n ymwneud â gwaith cymunedol a hybu a hyrwyddo. Mae'r maes sgiliau hefyd yn un arbennig o bwysig, ac mae gennym arolwg cyflogwyr ar hyn o bryd. Bydd canlyniadau hwnnw gennym ym mis Ionawr. Felly, nid ydym eisiau rhuthro i ddod i ganlyniadau yn rhy gynnar cyn i ni hel yr holl dystiolaeth a phenderfynu beth i'w wneud yn sgîl hynny i gyd.

[25] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n werth pwysleisio bod sawl arolwg wedi cymryd lle, ond rydym yn deall wrth gwrs fod rhaid gweithredu yn gyflym o ystyried y dystiolaeth sy'n dod o'r adolygiadau sydd wedi cymryd lle.

[26] **Christine Chapman:** Before I bring in Mike Hedges, could I ask you to check if your mobile phones are on, because there is some interference coming through?

[27] **Mike Hedges:** Following on from Rhodri Glyn Thomas's question, before I move on to questions on planning, the First Minister has heard me mention Twrw Tawe in Swansea many times, which provides a Welsh-medium opportunity for children who attend Welsh-medium schools within a social context. That is driven by the *menter iaith*. Should the *mentrau iaith* throughout Wales not be doing more along that line of allowing children to get involved in speaking Welsh outside the classroom within a social context?

[28] **The First Minister:** Yes, I think that that is one of their main challenges. I should mention that a review of the *mentrau iaith* has been taking place. We look forward to receiving that review this month, and there will be a statement from us as a Government in response to that review in the spring of next year. It is important that we understand in terms of the *mentrau iaith* what works, what does not work, how they can learn from each other and what works in certain contexts as well. What might work in Rhondda Cynon Taf is not necessarily going to work in Gwynedd, and vice versa. So, that review will be important in determining what the structure of the *mentrau iaith* will be in the future.

[29] **Mike Hedges:** Moving to planning, as we know, the number of communities where more than 80% of the population speak Welsh, where you are very likely to meet a fellow Welsh speaker, is reducing.

that we have a number of surveys coming in. We have the Welsh-speaking communities survey that will be published later today. There is also an economy language group that has been established, and it has almost completed its work from what I understand. We have commissioned a study of the work of the *mentrau iaith* and work at a community level also. So, we need to look at all of that before making concrete recommendations. We will be looking at all of that over the winter—over Christmas and the new year—and that will all feed into a further and more detailed statement, and perhaps a strategy related to community work and promotion. Skills are very important, and we have a survey of employers at present. We will have the results of that in January. So, we do not want to rush to conclusions too soon before we have gathered all of this evidence and decided what to do as a result of that evidence.

The First Minister: It is worth emphasising that there have been a number of reviews and surveys, but we understand that we need take action swiftly given the evidence provided in the reviews and surveys that have been carried out.

09:45

[30] Also, those with Welsh speakers numbering over 50%, where you have a 50:50 chance of meeting someone who speaks Welsh, are reducing. If you put 200 or 250 new homes in a number of those communities, they will drop out of either the 80% or the 50% fairly quickly. How will technical advice note 20 ensure the protection of the Welsh language in those areas where it is the language of day-to-day use?

[31] **The First Minister:** I expect local authorities to include TAN 20 as part of their local development plans. I expect local authorities to embed TAN 20 as part of the reviews that take place of their LDPs over the 10-year period, and I expect them to take account of TAN 20 in the early part of the review process. The issue that the Minister for planning and I wrestled with was this: around this table there are many of us who will know that, quite often, we have constituents who will come to us who are not happy with a planning application that it is proposed to be accepted, but when we drill down, we find that the planning application is in accord with the development plan. So, for me, the starting point is making sure that the language is considered and protected at the beginning of the process, namely the LDP process, rather than later on when individual planning applications come in. That is what we have done with TAN 20.

[32] The difficulty with requiring an obligation for there to be a language impact assessment on every planning application is a practical one. First, does that apply to every planning application? Probably not. Sensibly, of course not. Does it apply to planning applications that are above a certain size? The difficulty with that is that if we were to say that there has to be a language impact assessment as part of a planning application for more than 20 houses, for example, the temptation for a developer would be to break it up into four different applications of five and, therefore, come in underneath the threshold. It is much better to make sure that TAN 20 kicks in at the beginning of the LDP process, so that councils are aware of the fact that they need to undertake a language impact assessment to understand the effect on the language of a development in a particular area, and understand that that, of course, will lead potentially to a call in in the future, if they do not follow their own guidance.

[33] **Mike Hedges:** Many local authorities have already published their plans. Will you accept them now making amendments to those plans to take account of TAN 20? Also, the big problem is that if someone makes a planning application to build 200 houses on the Llŷn peninsula, for example, which would change it dramatically, I am sure that Gwynedd Council would turn it down—that is my prediction—but then the developers will appeal to the planning inspector. Will the planning inspector also take TAN 20 into account? I have seen some strange decisions by planning inspectors over the years, as has everyone else.

[34] **The First Minister:** Once a TAN is published in draft, it has effect and the planning inspectorate is required to take that TAN into consideration and to be guided by it. In terms of how TAN 20 is embedded in those authorities that have already adopted or proposed their LDPs, I would expect them to have regard to TAN 20 and look to include it as part of the review process of the LDPs that take place, I believe, on an annual basis.

[35] **Janet Finch-Saunders:** Good morning. In November, when the Welsh Language Commissioner came to give evidence, she expressed great disappointment about the fact that there is no reference to the Welsh language in the Social Services and Well-being (Wales) Bill. Given the importance of this Bill, what is your response to that criticism? I would like to know what your response is to her criticism of the sustainable development Bill White Paper, that the Government's definition of 'sustainable development' was not totally clear in relation to the Welsh language. She believes that there should be reference in all Bills as regards the Welsh language.

[36] **The First Minister:** There is no sustainable development Bill. There is the future generations Bill, which is very much a work in progress and the language will form part of that. In terms of the Social Services and Well-being (Wales) Bill, it is a question of what we are trying to achieve. Can you achieve the same outcome if you put something on the face of a Bill, or is it better achieved through secondary legislation in order to be more flexible? What I can say is that the Deputy Minister has stated very clearly her intention to build on the work of the Welsh language taskforce within health and social services, and, of course, to build on the strategy in '*Mwy na geiriau*', 'More than just words'. She wants to do that to ensure that there is a statutory framework in place, and also regulations, in order to secure provision in the Welsh language in the future. This is not a question of being resistant to ensuring that services are available in the Welsh language; it is a question of finding the best, most effective and most flexible way of ensuring that.

[37] **Simon Thomas:** Rwyf wedi derbyn nifer o gwynion dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf gan gleifion neu berthnasau i gleifion sydd yn ei ffeindio'n anodd credu nad yw eu mam-gu, neu bwy bynnag, yn cael gofal personol drwy'r Gymraeg. O sir Gâr reit lan i sir Geredigion, mae nifer o'r gofawyr yn ddi-Gymraeg ond Cymraeg yw iaith gyntaf nifer o'r genhedlaeth hŷn, felly mae rhywbeth personol iawn yn cael ei drafod yn eu hail iaith, ac mae hynny'n lletchwith iawn. Mae Comisiynydd y Gymraeg wedi cydnabod hyn ac mae hi'n gwneud gwaith yn y maes hwn hefyd i edrych ar hynny. A ydych yn derbyn bod dyletswydd ar y Llywodraeth i sicrhau bod y gweithlu ar gael i fedru darparu gwasanaeth drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg ar y lefel honno?

Simon Thomas: I have received a number of complaints over the last few years from patients or relatives of patients who find it difficult to believe that their grandmother, or whoever, does not receive personal care through the medium of Welsh. From Carmarthenshire right up to Ceredigion, a number of carers do not speak Welsh, but Welsh is the first language of many of the older generation, so something personal is being discussed in their second language, which is very awkward. The Welsh Language Commissioner has acknowledged this and is doing work in this field to look at that. Do you accept that it is a duty on the Government to ensure that the workforce is available to be able to provide services through the medium of Welsh at that level?

[38] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Ydw—nid yn uniongyrchol, wrth gwrs, oherwydd nid ni sy'n rhedeg y gwasanaethau yn uniongyrchol, ond mae dyletswydd.

The First Minister: Yes, I do—not directly, of course, because we do not run the services directly, but there is a duty.

[39] **Simon Thomas:** Na, nid yn uniongyrchol, ond mae dyletswydd genedlaethol.

Simon Thomas: No, not directly, but there is a national duty.

[40] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Rwy'n deall hynny, oherwydd mae rhai yn dweud—ac nid wyf yn cyd-fynd â'r safbwynt hwn—fod pawb yn deall Saesneg, felly beth yw'r ots. Fodd bynnag, rydym i gyd yn gwybod, pan fydd pobl yn dost neu eisiau gofal, maen nhw'n mo'yn cael y gofal hwnnw yn eu hiaith gyntaf, yn enwedig pobl o'r genhedlaeth hŷn sy'n gyfarwydd iawn â siarad Cymraeg ac sy'n teimlo'n well os ydynt yn siarad Cymraeg gyda rhywun. Maen nhw'n teimlo'n fwy cartrefol os ydynt yn gwneud hynny. Felly, mae hynny'n bwysig dros ben. Hefyd, nid dim ond mater ydyw o

The First Minister: I understand that, because some say—and I do not agree with this viewpoint—that everyone understands English, so what does it matter. However, we all know that, when people are unwell or require care, they want to be cared for through the medium of their first language, particularly people from the older generation, who are used to speaking Welsh and feel better if they are communicating through the medium of Welsh. They feel more comfortable in doing that. So, that is hugely important. Also, it is not just a matter of ensuring that they are comfortable because

sicrhau eu bod yn gyfforddus oherwydd eu bod yn cael gofal yn eu dewis iaith; rwyf wedi gweld fy hun bod rhai pobl sydd efallai yn dioddef strôc sy'n colli eu Saesneg. Mae nhw'n colli'r gallu i ddeall Saesneg a dim ond yn gallu siarad Cymraeg. Mae'n bwysig dros ben bod y bobl hynny yn derbyn gwasanaethau lle maen nhw'n gallu deall y person sy'n rhoi gofal iddynt. Felly, rwy'n derbyn bod dyletswydd er mwyn sicrhau bod gwasanaeth ar gael i bobl sy'n siarad Cymraeg. Nod y Dirprwy Weinidog yw sicrhau bod hynny'n digwydd yn y dyfodol.

[41] **Simon Thomas:** Sut y gallwn gyflawni hyn? Mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r gwaith hwnnw yn dibynnu ar y gweithlu Cymraeg yn dod drwy'r colegau a bod yr opsiwn o ddarparu gofal drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yn opsiwn agored i nifer o'n pobl ifanc, bod y maes yn cael ei barchu, ond hefyd bod y ddarpariaeth ar gael. Mae'r ddarpariaeth yn ddiffygiol mewn sawl lle yng Nghymru ac rydych newydd sôn wrth fy nghyfaill Rhodri Glyn Thomas am doriadau a pham y mae'n rhaid ichi eu gwneud nhw, ond serch hynny, mae toriadau yn y gyllideb ar gyfer addysg bellach. Sut y gallwn sicrhau bod strategaeth gweithlu yn ei lle a fydd yn caniatáu ac yn annog pobl i ddewis y gwaith fel gyrfa, ond hefyd i ddewis i'w wneud drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg? Ar hyn o bryd, rydym i bob pwrpas yn mewnforio—yn ystyr ehangach y gair—pobl heb sgiliau iaith i lenwi bylchau yn ein gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ni, ond mae'n wasanaeth eilradd os nad ydych yn gallu defnyddio'ch iaith gyntaf. Mae un Aelod Cynulliad wedi dweud, ar ôl iddo gael cnoc ar ei ben, yn Gymraeg yr oedd am drafod pethau ac yr oedd yn anodd iddo wneud hynny. Mae hynny'n cael ei adlewyrchu yn gyffredinol drwy'r gorllewin ar hyn o bryd.

[42] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae dyletswydd ar awdurdodau lleol i wneud dau beth. Yn gyntaf, mae'n rhaid iddynt sicrhau bod digon yn y gweithlu sy'n gallu rhoi gwasanaeth yn y Gymraeg ond mae hefyd rhaid iddynt sicrhau bod adnoddau ar gael i hyfforddi pobl nid dim ond i ddysgu'r Gymraeg ond i wella eu Cymraeg neu i fagu hyder o ran siarad Cymraeg. Mae hynny'n ddyletswydd, yn fy marn i, ar awdurdodau lleol. Felly, mae'n bwysig dros ben eu bod yn cymryd o ddifrif

they are receiving care in their preferred language; I have seen myself that there are some people who, perhaps, suffer a stroke and who lose their ability to use the English language. They can no longer understand English and can speak only Welsh. It is very important that those people can access services where they understand the person who is caring for them. Therefore, I accept that there is a duty to ensure that services are available to Welsh speakers. The aim of the Deputy Minister is to ensure that that happens in the future.

Simon Thomas: How can we achieve this? Most of that work depends on a Welsh-speaking workforce coming through the colleges and that the option of delivering care through the medium of Welsh is an option for many of our young people, that the field is respected, but also that the provision is available. The provision is deficient in many parts of Wales, and you have just talked to my colleague Rhodri Glyn Thomas about cuts and the reasons why you have to make them, but, despite that, there are cuts to the budget for further education. How can we ensure that there is a workforce strategy in place that allows and encourages people to choose this as a career, but that also encourages them to do so through the medium of Welsh? At the moment, we are, to all intents and purposes, importing—in the widest sense of the word—people without language skills to fill the gaps in our social services, but it is a second-class service if it is not possible for people to use their first language. One Assembly Member has said that, after he had had a knock to the head, he wanted to discuss things through the medium of Welsh, but that it was difficult for him to do that. That is reflected generally across west Wales at the moment.

The First Minister: There is a duty on local authorities to do two things. First, they have to ensure that there are sufficient numbers in the workforce who can provide services through the medium of Welsh, but they also have to ensure that resources are available not only for people to learn Welsh, but to improve or garner confidence in their Welsh-language abilities. That is a duty on local authorities, in my view. It is very important that they take seriously their responsibilities

eu dyletswyddau i sicrhau bod adnoddau ar gael i ddysgu Cymraeg i'w staff neu wella sgiliau Cymraeg eu staff. Lle nad yw'n bosibl i recriwtio'r niferoedd sydd eu hangen, mae'n bwysig dros ben bod modd i sicrhau bod pobl yn gallu dysgu Cymraeg o'r dechrau neu wella'r Gymraeg sydd ganddynt.

to ensure that resources are available to teach Welsh to their staff or to improve the Welsh-language skills of their staff. Where it is not possible to recruit the numbers required, it is extremely important to ensure that there are means for people to learn Welsh from scratch or to improve the Welsh-language skills that they have.

[43] **Simon Thomas:** A fydddech felly am osod rhyw fath o ddisgwyliadau neu dargedau dros gyfnod, yn seiliedig ar waith y comisiynydd, i sicrhau bod y maes hwn yn cael y sylw priodol a dyledus?

Simon Thomas: Would you therefore be looking at setting out some sort of expectations or targets over a period of time, based on the work of the commissioner, to ensure that this gets the attention it deserves?

[44] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hwn yn faes pwysig dros ben a byddwn i, yn bersonol, yn mo'yn ei ystyried yn fanwl er mwyn sicrhau bod gwasanaethau ar gael i siaradwyr Cymraeg yn y dyfodol. Ynglŷn â thargedau, mae'n anodd gwybod ar hyn o bryd beth yw'r sefyllfa ym mhob rhan o Gymru, ond byddwn yn erfyn ar awdurdodau lleol i sicrhau bod darpariaeth ar gael yn y Gymraeg, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd lle mae'r Gymraeg yn iaith gymunedol, er mwyn sicrhau bod y gwasanaeth sydd gyda nhw yn eang.

The First Minister: This is an exceptionally important area and I would personally like to consider it in detail in order to ensure that there are services available to Welsh speakers in the future. In terms of targets, it is difficult to know at present what the situation is in all parts of Wales, but I would expect local authorities to ensure that there is provision available through the medium of Welsh, particularly in those areas where Welsh is the community language, in order to ensure that the services are widely available.

[45] **Christine Chapman:** Thank you. Gwyn Price is next.

[46] **Gwyn R. Price:** Good morning. Regarding the use of the Welsh language within the Welsh Government, what is the difference between the improvement plan approved in October 2012 and the new improvement plan referred to in the First Minister's paper to this committee? Why was a revised version required?

[47] **The First Minister:** It is better than the original version, I would argue. That is why a revised version was needed. For example, one of the things that we have done is to embed the idea of Welsh language champions within Government. Their job is to make sure that, where new opportunities arise, the Welsh language is embedded so that it can be used, and to ensure that it is mainstreamed throughout the work of Government. I think that it is fair to say that things have changed much for the better in the past 10 years. At one time—at about the start of the last decade, I think—the percentage of Welsh speakers in Cathays park was 5%. It was much higher in the offices in Carmarthen, and, indeed, in Llandrindod—and, of course, in Caernarfon, in particular—but it was a poor situation to be in. That has improved, and much more attention is now given to not just encouraging staff to learn Welsh, but offering opportunities for people to use the language in the course of their everyday working lives and to gain the confidence that they need. The Welsh language champions are an important part of that.

[48] **Gwyn R. Price:** Thank you.

[49] **Christine Chapman:** Rhodri Glyn is next.

[50] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Roedd sôn, **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** There was talk, First Brif Weinidog, y byddai asesiad effaith ar yr Minister, that there would be an assessment

iaith Gymraeg ar draws portffolios y Llywodraeth. A oedd asesiad wedi digwydd cyn penderfynu ar y toriadau ar gyllidebau portffolios o ran y Gymraeg?

[51] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Rydym wastad yn ystyried effaith pob symudiad o fewn y gyllideb, yn enwedig toriadau, ar yr iaith. Yn anffodus, nid yw hi'n bosibl sicrhau cyllideb lle nad oes toriadau o gwbl, ac mae'n rhaid i ni ystyried, wrth gwrs, os ydym yn edrych ar gyllideb yr iaith Gymraeg, nad yw'n rhoi'r darlun cyfan o faint sydd yn cael ei hala ar yr iaith Gymraeg ar draws y portffolios. Caroline, a oes gennych rywbeth i ddweud am hynny?

[52] **Dr Turner:** Rydym yn cydnabod bod angen trefn lawer iawn mwy clir i fesur yr effaith. Rydym wedi bod yn edrych dros y chwe mis diwethaf ar y ffordd fwyaf effeithiol o wneud hynny, ac wedi bod yn trafod efo cydweithwyr yn yr adran gyllid a hefyd cydweithwyr yn yr adran gydraddoldeb i ddysgu o'r hyn y maen nhw'n ei wneud eisoes efo elfennau eraill o'r gyllideb. Mae gennym brosiect sydd newydd ddechrau i baratoi ar gyfer y safonau a fydd yn cael eu gosod arnom ni fel corff, a dyna pam mae angen i ni gael rhaglen well a mwy trylwyr a manwl, ond hefyd, ochr yn ochr efo hynny, gwneud pethau eraill i roi trefn llawer fwy trylwyr yn ei lle o ran gweld lle y mae'r gwariant ar y Gymraeg, ac ym mha gyllidebau y mae. Wrth gwrs, mae wedi ei brif ffrydio, felly nid yw'n beth hawdd i adnabod ym mhob man. Rydym ar hyn o bryd yn paratoi i roi system lawer iawn mwy trylwyr at ei gilydd. Rydym wedi edrych ar wahanol ffyrdd o wneud hyn—rydym wedi cael cyngor gan yr adran gyllid a'r adran gydraddoldeb. Rydym wedi edrych ar ei wneud yn fanwl iawn, ac rydym wedi edrych ar ei wneud yn strategol—mae un yn rhy fanwl, a mae'r llall efallai yn rhy arwynebol. Felly, rydym yn chwilio am rywbeth yn y canol a fydd yn golygu mwy ac yn ein helpu ni ar gyfer y dyfodol.

[53] **Simon Thomas:** A yw'n fwriad yn y pen draw i gael gweithlu dwyieithog yn y gwasanaeth sifil yng Nghymru?

[54] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Byddwn i'n

of the impact on the Welsh language across Government portfolios. Was there an assessment before deciding on the cuts in portfolio budgets in terms of the Welsh language?

The First Minister: We always consider the impact of any changes to the budgets, particularly cuts, on the language. Unfortunately, it is not possible to secure a budget where there are no cuts whatsoever, and we must consider, of course, that, if we look at the Welsh language budget, it does not give you the full picture as to how much is actually spent on the Welsh language across portfolios. Caroline, do you have something to say about that?

Dr Turner: We recognise that we need a much clearer system in order to measure the impact. We have been looking over the last six months at the most effective way of doing that, and have been discussing with colleagues in the finance department and also the equalities department to learn from what they are already doing with other elements of the budget. We have a project that has just started to prepare for the standards that will be placed on us as a body, and that is why we have to have an improved and more thorough and detailed programme, but also, alongside that, do other things to put a much more thorough system in place in terms of seeing where there is expenditure on the Welsh language, and in which budgets it is. Of course, it is mainstreamed, so it is not easy to recognise in all places at the moment. We are preparing at the moment to put a more thorough system together. We have looked at different ways of doing this—we have had advice from the finance department and the equalities department. We have looked at doing this in a very detailed way, and we have looked at doing it strategically—one is too detailed, and the other is perhaps too superficial. Therefore, we are looking for something in the middle that will mean more and that will help us in the future.

Simon Thomas: Is it ultimately the intention to have a bilingual workforce within the civil service?

The First Minister: I would say that we are

dweud bod hynny yn bell i ffwrdd. Mae'n nod, ond nid wyf yn credu bod hynny yn mynd i ddigwydd yn fuan iawn. Yn fy marn i, mae'n rhaid i ni hybu pobl a chefnogi pobl i ddysgu Cymraeg, lle eu bod nhw eisiau gwneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn credu y byddai hynny'n ymarferol, yn enwedig dros y blynyddoedd nesaf. Mae'n rhaid i ni fod yn ofalus am hyn, wrth gwrs. Mae'n rhaid sicrhau nad yw pobl sydd yn ddi-Gymraeg yn meddwl na fydd swyddi gyda nhw o fewn Llywodraeth Cymru. Rydym i gyd yn gwybod ac yn deall bod hyn yn rhywbeth sensitif iawn. Felly, fy marn i yw y dylem helpu pobl sydd yn mo'yn dysgu Cymraeg, ond byddai neges a fyddai'n dweud, 'Mae'n rhaid i chi siarad Cymraeg er mwyn gweithio i Lywodraeth Cymru' yn un anodd dros ben, wrth feddwl am beth yw'r nifer a'r canran o siaradwyr Cymraeg yn y boblogaeth yn gyffredinol.

10:00

[55] **Simon Thomas:** Beth yw'r canran sy'n siarad Cymraeg ym mharc Cathays yn awr?

[56] **Dr Turner:** O fewn parc Cathays rydym wedi bod yn edrych ar y gwahanol lefelau o allu. O ran bod yn weddol rugl, lefel 4 neu 5, mae tua 15% ar draws Llywodraeth Cymru ac ar draws yr ystâd. Os ydym yn cynnwys pobl lefel 3, sydd wedi dysgu Cymraeg yn eithaf da a bod ganddynt botensial i gynyddu a gwella trwy fynd ar gyrsiau a defnyddio'r Gymraeg yn fwy, mae'n agosach at 20%. Mae'n amrywio o swyddfa i swyddfa. Llandudno sydd â'r elfen gryfaf ac mae Aberystwyth yn reit dda hefyd. Fodd bynnag, mae'n syndod bellach faint o Gymraeg sy'n cael ei siarad yn y de-ddwyrain hefyd, gan gynnwys ym mharc Cathays. Mae'r ganran yn sicr wedi cynyddu dros y 10 i 15 mlynedd ddiwethaf.

[57] **Simon Thomas:** Pa gyfleoedd sydd gan weision sifil i ddefnyddio'r Gymraeg yn eu gwaith? A ydynt yn cael e-bostio eu cydweithwyr yn Gymraeg? A ydynt yn cael paratoi gwaith yn Gymraeg i gael ei gyfieithu i'r Saesneg, yn lle'r ffordd arall rownd, fel rydym wastad yn ei gweld? Beth yw'r hawliau, fel petai, yn yr ystyr ehangach o ddefnyddio'r Gymraeg yn y gweithle?

a long way off from that. It is an ambition, but I do not think that it is going to happen any time soon. In my opinion, we need to encourage people and support people to learn Welsh, where they want to do so. However, I do not think that that would be practicable, particularly over the next few years. We have to be careful here, of course. We need to ensure that non-Welsh speakers do not start to feel that there are no jobs available to them within the Welsh Government. We all know and understand that this is a very sensitive issue. Therefore, my opinion is that we should assist those people who want to learn Welsh, but any message that says, 'You have to speak Welsh to work for the Welsh Government' would be a very difficult one, given the number and percentage of Welsh speakers within the population in general.

Simon Thomas: What is the percentage of Welsh speakers in Cathays park now?

Dr Turner: Within Cathays park we have been looking at the various levels of ability. In terms of being relatively fluent, level 4 or 5, it is around 15% across the Welsh Government and across the estate. If we include people at level 3, who have learned Welsh to a relatively high standard and who have the potential to improve by attending further courses and making more use of the Welsh language, it is closer to 20%. It varies from one office to another. Llandudno is one of the strongest and Aberystwyth is quite strong also. However, it is surprising now how much Welsh is spoken in the south-east, including in Cathays park. The percentage has certainly increased over the last 10 to 15 years.

Simon Thomas: What opportunities do civil servants have to use the Welsh language in their work? Can they e-mail colleagues through the medium of Welsh? Can they draft material in Welsh for it to be translated into English, rather than the other way around, as we always see? What are the rights, as it were, in the wider sense of using the Welsh language in the workplace?

[58] **Dr Turner:** Nid oes cyfyngiadau penodol o gwbl. Rwyf wedi gweithio'n gwbl ddwyieithog dros y 15 mlynedd diwethaf. Rwy'n ffodus ar hyn o bryd fy mod yn arwain tîm lle mae pawb, ond un, yn rhugl.

Dr Turner: There are no specific restrictions at all. I have worked entirely bilingually over the last 15 years. I am fortunate at the moment in that I am leading a team where everyone, except one, is fluent.

[59] **Simon Thomas:** Os caf ddweud, rydych efallai'n eithriad.

Simon Thomas: If I may say so, you are perhaps the exception.

[60] **Dr Turner:** Efallai ein bod ni. Fodd bynnag, mewn swyddi blaenorol, pan oeddwn yn gweithio i Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru ac ym maes datblygiad gwledig flynyddoedd yn ôl, roedd hynny'n wir i raddau helaeth yn y swyddi hynny hefyd. Felly, mae'n bosibl. Un o'r pethau rydym wedi bod yn ei gwneud dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf yw edrych ar yr ystadegau a gweld lle mae'r pocedi o siaradwyr Cymraeg yn bodoli o fewn gwahanol adrannau ac annog yr adrannau hynny i ddatblygu'r timau hynny a rhoi cyfle i ddysgwyr i ddod i mewn. Rwyf wedi gwneud hynny o fewn fy nhîm fy hun, gan roi cyfle i ddysgwyr ddod i mewn a gweithio mewn awyrgylch Gymraeg, a thrwy hynny gwella'u hyder a'u sgiliau. Mae'n mynd i gymryd amser. Wrth gwrs, dros y bum mlynedd ddiwethaf, nid ydym wedi bod yn recriwtio cymaint oherwydd y cyfyngiadau ar y gyllideb. Felly, rydym wedi bod yn trio gweithio o fewn yr hyn sydd gyda ni eisoes. Dyna lle mae rôl i gyrsiau dysgu Cymraeg a gloywi iaith. Fodd bynnag, nid oes cyfyngiadau ar allu pobl i weithio yn Gymraeg, bod yn e-bostio neu baratoi gwaith. Un o'r cyfyngiadau, wrth gwrs, yw nad oes neb yn gweithio ar ei ben ei hun. Mae pobl yn cydweithio ar draws y Llywodraeth ac efo swyddfeydd preifat a Gweinidogion. Felly, mae eisiau bod yn ymwybodol hefyd o bwy arall sydd eisiau bod yn rhan o'r sgwrs wrth ddatblygu polisi.

Dr Turner: Perhaps we are. However, in previous jobs, when I worked for Welsh European Funding Office and in rural development many years ago, that was also true in those posts to a great extent. So, it is possible. One of the things that we have been doing over the past year is to look at the statistics and identify where the pockets of Welsh speakers are within different departments, and we encourage those departments to develop those teams and give Welsh learners the opportunity to come in. I have done so within my own team, giving Welsh learners the opportunity to come in and to work in a Welsh-medium environment and so improve their confidence and skills. It is going to take time. Of course, over the past five years, we have not been recruiting as much because of budgetary restrictions. So, we have been trying to work within the resources available to us already. That is where the Welsh language courses and Welsh language improvement courses come in. However, there are no restrictions on people's ability to work through the medium of Welsh, be that e-mailing or drafting material. One of the limitations, of course, is that nobody works alone. People are collaborating across Government and with private offices and Ministers. Therefore, you need to be aware of who else wants to be part of the conversation in developing policy.

[61] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n dibynnu, wrth gwrs. Un o'r pethau rwy'n ffeindio yw bod y rhan fwyaf o fanylion rwy'n cael, o ran cael fy mriaffio, yn Saesneg. Pan fydd *briefings*, weithiau, ynglŷn â'r iaith Gymraeg, dim ond yn y Gymraeg—wel, rwyf wedi dweud dim ond yn y Gymraeg rwyf yn mo'yn y manylion a'r *briefing*. Felly, rwyf mewn sefyllfa hynod o od y bore yma, lle mae pobl yn gofyn cwestiynau i fi yn

The First Minister: It depends, of course. One of the things that I find is that most of the details I have, when I am briefed, are in English. When there are briefings, sometimes, in relation to the Welsh language, they are in Welsh only—well, I have said that I only want the details and the briefing in Welsh. So, I am in a very odd situation this morning, where people are asking me questions in English and I have to translate

Saesneg, ac rwy'n gorfod cyfieithu'r the notes in front of me from Welsh to
nodiadau sydd o'm blaen o'r Gymraeg i'r English. Usually, it is the other way around.
Saesneg. Fel rheol, y ffordd arall rownd mae
hi.

[62] **Christine Chapman:** We have about 25 minutes left. I will bring in Jenny Rathbone.

[63] **Jenny Rathbone:** I want to talk about Welsh-medium education and its relationship to some of our other objectives. Bilingualism is a very important skill in this increasingly global world. How does our objective to have 25% of seven year olds taught through the medium of Welsh by 2015, which I acknowledge has been recognised as unlikely to be achieved in the paper that was published in July, conflict or concur with our other policy to tackle the gap between attainment and poverty?

[64] **The First Minister:** I do not think that the two things are mutually exclusive. Certainly, there is evidence to suggest that, where children are educated bilingually, they have advantages, not only in learning other languages, but in terms of the way that they think. So, I do not think that it is a question of, 'Do you tackle poverty or do you promote the Welsh language?' The two things will quite often run hand in hand. In terms of the target, we have seen an increase in the number of children who are seven years old being taught through the medium of Welsh. It has gone from 18.8% in 2002 to 21.9% in 2012. So, the target, I believe, is more than achievable. We have also, as a Government, launched an information campaign so that, where parents want to choose Welsh-medium education, they do not feel that there are barriers to them doing that. For example, people might ask, 'Will I be able to help the children with homework? How difficult will it be?', if they come from a background that is wholly without the Welsh language. I launched that scheme in Blackwood some three weeks ago.

[65] **Jenny Rathbone:** I am a governor at a Welsh-medium school in a super-output area of deprivation. It would be fair to say that the intake does not, at the moment, reflect the local community. We know that there are children who arrive at nursery with, perhaps, a dozen words at the age of three, because they are simply not spoken to. Bilingualism is great, but it is difficult initially, and, if you do not have communication skills in any language it is very difficult to then succeed, initially, bilingually.

[66] **The First Minister:** I do not think that that is right. Children are like sponges. They tend to pick up languages quite easily. I agree with you, because I have seen it myself, that there are children coming into schools now who have not been spoken to and have to have speech and language therapy, not because they have an intrinsic problem, but because no-one has ever really helped them with their vocabulary. That is a problem. However, I think that it is very possible for children to learn more than one language at a very young age. We see it, of course, in Cardiff, where we have a number of languages in parts of Cardiff where children will speak a different language, or, indeed, languages, at home and then they develop their English, and often their Welsh, in schools. I do not think that there is a limit to the number of languages that children can pick up—well, there must be a limit, but certainly two is not the limit in terms of the number of languages that children can pick up at any one time. If we look at what happens in other parts of Europe, for example, we see that, quite often, children will speak three or even four languages. It is the same in parts of Africa, where two or three languages is the norm. So, I do not think that a bilingual education creates a situation where children can speak neither language properly; I just think that it creates a situation where children can speak both languages properly. The influence of English means that there is English all around children, so it is easier for them, quite often, to pick up English than it is to pick up Welsh, particularly if there is no Welsh at home, but the schools more than make up for that. The Welsh-medium school in my town is effective in terms of its social mix. It sits in a Communities First area, and a number of the children from the estate around the school go

to the Welsh-medium school. I remember canvassing in the area for the last Assembly election and being surprised at the children coming up to me and speaking to me in Welsh, which is quite unusual in Bridgend. However, it shows that the school is effective in terms of drawing in a good cross-section of children from the community. It will vary across Wales, of course, in terms of the way that things work. In Cardiff, where people often have a choice of schools in a small area, that may not work in the same way. However, I do not think that it is right—and the evidence suggests that it is not the case—that children somehow have to focus on one language at the expense of another language or other languages otherwise they will end up imperfect in all of them. Given the fact that we have probably 30 languages spoken in Cardiff alone, we have examples of children who can be fluent in their home language and one or two other languages as well.

[67] **Jenny Rathbone:** The UK Government is going to introduce a foreign language into English primary schools as of next year. Is that something that the Welsh Government is considering: introducing a foreign language into primary schools in addition to our bilingual policy?

[68] **The First Minister:** It is something that we must always consider, because we know how important it is that our children have a facility in languages that is the equal of those elsewhere in the UK or better. We have many thousands of bilingual children. We have a template on which to build, and we have expertise in teaching a language to children who have no previous experience of it, either in the community or the home. I think that we can use that expertise to introduce a third language, or even a fourth language, at the appropriate time, given the experience that we have. The fact that we have two languages being taught routinely in our schools—albeit in different ways in different schools—I think gives us an advantage in terms of teaching another language.

[69] **Jenny Rathbone:** Excellent. The other problem is the culture of social media. Many young people spend a lot of time on Facebook and the internet in one form or another, or watching cartoons made in the United States—some people say that they are in the English language. How difficult do you think it is for us to nurture and increase the use of the Welsh language to be spoken in daily life given the dominance of the English language in so many aspects of children's lives?

[70] **The First Minister:** You are quite right: English is dominant in terms of social media, and that is true not just of Wales, but across much of the world, in reality. The important thing then, of course, is to give people the opportunity to use technology through the medium of Welsh, which is why we have a technology fund that we are setting up. That is designed to improve opportunities for children to use Welsh in social media, particularly through using apps. The reality is that they will still use a lot of English, but as long as they have the opportunity, and we encourage them to use Welsh through creating those opportunities, then Welsh will become accepted as a language that is used in social media. We can never challenge the dominance of English, but what we can do is to provide opportunities and encourage children to use those opportunities to use social media in Welsh, particularly through the use of apps.

[71] **Christine Chapman:** We are starting to run a bit short of time, so I ask Members for very concise questions, because I know that there is quite a lot of ground to cover. Mike Hedges and Mark Isherwood have supplementary questions.

[72] **Mike Hedges:** This is very concise: will the First Minister commend Mudiad Meithrin for the work that it is doing with young children? Secondly, is the First Minister aware that, in Flying Start areas, children are being sent to the English-medium schools even though there is a Welsh-medium school available that has a Flying Start attached to it? I have been told, not only by constituents, but by family members, that they wish to go a Flying Start

attached to a Welsh-medium school that is in a Flying Start area, but they are being directed to their local English Flying Start.

[73] **The First Minister:** I was not aware of that, but I will examine that to see what the situation is. If you could provide me with information about that, I would be more than happy to investigate it.

[74] **Christine Chapman:** Could you come back to us on that?

[75] **First Minister:** Yes, I will.

[76] **Mark Isherwood:** My children and their friends started learning Welsh when they went to an English-medium school with puppets, but it very quickly morphed into a classical language education. They came to associate the Welsh language with academia, with a dry, educational subject rather than social use. How can we address that within the classroom, so that it is a conversational, social tool? Linked to that, for many children, particularly in an English-medium school, their first association with Welsh through school, but outside school, is at the Urdd Eisteddfod. One of my daughters was a national winner, but I have seen others knocked out early. When they go to their first town heats, and then the three names come up on a piece of paper stuck on the wall, if they are not one of those three names, they go home without a 'thank you' and associate, from that point, the Welsh language with failure. Could more be done? I know that the Welsh Government is not responsible for the Urdd Eisteddfod but could more be done to encourage recognition of effort, so that there is a positive association at that young age?

[77] **The First Minister:** There are two really interesting points that have been raised there, and one which had not struck me, in terms of Welsh being associated with failure. It is important that there is competition, in that field at least, and it is important that all children have a positive image of the Welsh language when they take part in eisteddfodau. It is an interesting point; I need to ponder that in terms of what we might be able to do with the local eisteddfodau, working with the Urdd in order to make sure that children do not go away feeling that way. I will take that up with the Urdd.

[78] You have hit the nub of the challenge, which is: how do you create an environment for the Welsh language where it is used outside the school, particularly but not exclusively for those whose only experience of it is within the school, either through learning it as a second language or through using it in a Welsh-medium or bilingual school? What we are focused on is the need to make sure that there are more activities available in Welsh, and that much has been picked up on, particularly the example that I gave earlier on; and working with the Urdd and the *mentrau iaith* to make there are activities for young people, particularly teenagers, who are particularly difficult to encourage to use Welsh. They seem to reach the age of 12 and there is a gap of a few years where they do not use the Welsh language, so it is about finding ways particularly of ensuring that there is youth club provision through the medium of Welsh where they can at least go and mix with each other in an atmosphere where Welsh is the language of social discourse. Working with the Urdd and the *mentrau iaith*, and working on the back of the 'cynhadledd fawr', what we are looking at is to see what we can do in terms of putting in place possibly in future a network of those provisions to make sure that they are available across Wales. The Urdd does that already, of course, but the Urdd's provision is not universal across Wales. It is important that we find ways to ensure that children are able to socialise, or see it as normal and natural to socialise, through the medium of Welsh outside school in at least one particular environment.

10:15

[79] **Mark Isherwood:** What about more conversation in the classroom?

[80] **The First Minister:** I am not expert on language teaching but there are two approaches. One is the grammatical approach and the other is the conversational approach. Much of it depends on the teacher—not only on the teacher but on the school’s general attitude towards the Welsh language. In almost no other sphere of life, apart from politics perhaps, does the leadership of an organisation reflect the organisation itself. If the leadership is weak, the organisation does not work, unlike hospitals, for example. If the leadership is strong, then the organisation works. We need to understand how we can encourage more heads to take the Welsh language seriously and to promote it. I often use the example of Treorchy Comprehensive School, as an English-medium school that has generated confident Welsh speakers and—I think that I am right in saying—Welsh speakers who have done GCSEs in Welsh because of the actions of the current head and the previous head. Those are good examples that I believe that we can look to roll out across the rest of Wales.

[81] **Simon Thomas:** Roeddwn yn falch o’ch clywed yn dweud, Brif Weinidog, pa mor bwysig yw mwy nag un iaith a dwyieithrwydd mewn perthynas â chyrrhaeddiad plant. Mae’r dystiolaeth ryngwladol yn amlwg iawn. Mae’n ddiddorol sylwi, o ran y gwledydd a wnaeth yn eithaf da yn y canlyniadau Rhaglen Rhyngwladol Asesu Myfyrwyr ddoe, fod nifer ohonynt yn dysgu dwy neu hyd yn oed dair iaith, felly mae’n bwysig ein bod yn lladd unrhyw syniad bod ymennydd plentyn yn bwl yn hytrach na’n spwng. Mae modd ichi ychwanegu ato drwy ddyysgu. Yng nghydestun rhoi mwy o gyfleoedd i blant a phobl ifanc o ardaloedd difreintiedig, yn enwedig i fod yn ddwyieithog ac efallai i wella eu cyrrhaeddiad drwy hynny, mae Dechrau’n Deg yn hynod bwysig, fel y dywedodd Mike Hedges. Hoffwn ategu’r hyn a ddywedodd Mike a dyfynnu’n fyr o lythyr a ysgrifennwyd at bob awdurdod gan un o’ch swyddogion, yn pryderu am

Simon Thomas: I was pleased to hear you say, First Minister, how important having more than one language and bilingualism is to child attainment. The international evidence is very clear. It is interesting to notice that many of the countries that did quite well in the Programme for International Student Assessment results yesterday teach two or three languages, so it is important that we put paid to the idea that a child’s brain is a pit rather than a sponge. You can add to it through learning. In the context of providing children and young people from deprived areas with more opportunities, particularly to be bilingual and perhaps to improve their attainment through that, Flying Start, as Mike Hedges has just mentioned, is extremely important. I want to endorse what Mike said and quote briefly from a letter written to every authority by one of your officials, expressing concerns about

[82] ‘the low uptake of Welsh-language childcare provision’.

[83] Mae’n wir i ddweud nad yw Dechrau’n Deg, ar hyn o bryd, yn adlewyrchu addysg ar ôl tair a phump oed yn Gymraeg yn yr ardaloedd hynny. Beth wnewch i wneud yn siwr bod Dechrau’n Deg yn cydlynu gydag addysg Gymraeg a’ch polisi addysg yn fwy cyffredinol?

It is true to say that Flying Start, at present, does not reflect education post the ages of three and five in Welsh in those areas. What will you do to ensure that Flying Start works with Welsh-medium education and your education policy more generally?

[84] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae’n rhaid i’r cydlynriad hwnnw ddigwydd, oherwydd rydym yn gefnogol i’r iaith ac mae’n bwysig dros ben bod y rhaglenni sydd gennym yn cefnogi’r iaith hefyd—rwy’n deall hynny. Nid oeddwn yn ymwybodol o’r enghraifft a roddodd Mike ond byddaf yn ysgrifennu yn

The First Minister: That co-ordination must happen, because we support the language and it is important that the programmes that we have support the language too—I understand that. I was not aware of the example given by Mike, but I will write back to the committee, when I have considered this, to improve

ôl at y pwyllgor wedi imi ystyried hyn, i wella pethau os yw'n gywir—nid wyf yn anghytuno â'r hyn a ddywedodd Mike—bod rhyw fath o feddwl y dylai plant difreintiedig fynd i ysgolion Saesneg.

[85] **Simon Thomas:** Mae rhyw fath o feddwl weithiau nad yw plant difreintiedig yw gallu ymdopi â mwy nag un iaith. Mae'n amlwg yn addysgiadol nad yw hynny'n wir—yn rhyngwladol ac yn ôl y dystiolaeth academaidd.

[86] Gan symud ymlaen o hynny, un o'r pethau a fydd yn allweddol fydd yr ymgyrch farchnata a lansiwyd gennych yn y Coed Duon. Mae'n bwysig ei bod yn dangos yn glir beth yw manteision addysg ddwyieithog a'r dewis sydd gan rieni i wneud hynny. A fyddwch yn gwneud yn siŵr bod y strategaeth honno yn ymestyn i lawr i'r cyfnod cyn ysgol, fel Dechrau'n Deg, fel bod y dewis yn cael ei wneud ar yr adeg priodol? Beth a wnewch hefyd i sicrhau bod yr ymgyrch honno'n cael ei chydnabod yn fwy eang? Daethoch i'r grŵp trawsbleidiol ar yr iaith Gymraeg y bore yma ac rwy'n credu ei bod yn wir i ddweud nad oedd ambell i Aelod wedi clywed am yr ymgyrch farchnata gan y Llywodraeth, efallai gan nad oes datganiad wedi'i wneud yn y Siambr.

[87] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Roedd datganiad ysgrifenedig, os cofiaf yn iawn. Roedd y cyfryngau yn y lansiad—nid oedd yn rhywbeth cyfrinachol.

[88] **Simon Thomas:** Rwy'n derbyn hynny ond os oes ambell i Aelod heb glywed amdano, mae'n dangos y gwaith caib a rhaw sydd ar ôl i'w wneud.

[89] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Gofynnaf i Caroline mewn munud esbonio yn ymarferol sut mae'r ymgyrch yn gweithio. Y nod yw sicrhau bod plant rhwng geni a thair blwydd oed, neu eu rhieni, yn cael eu dal o dan yr ymgyrch hon i sicrhau bod y penderfyniad yn cael ei wneud yr amser hwnnw. Rydym yn gwybod bod plant yn dechrau addysg Gymraeg ac yn symud i addysg Saesneg—ychydig o blant—ac mae ychydig sy'n mynd y ffordd arall. Felly, mae'n bwysig bod y penderfyniad yn cael ei wneud yn gynnar ym mywyd plentyn i sicrhau ei fod yn mynd i

things if it is right—I do not disagree with what Mike said—that there is some sort of mindset that disadvantaged children should go to English-medium schools.

Simon Thomas: There is some sort of mindset sometimes that children from disadvantaged backgrounds cannot cope with more than one language. It is clear that that is not true, educationally—both internationally and in academic evidence.

Moving on from that, one thing that will be vital to this is the marketing campaign that you launched in Blackwood. It is important that that shows clearly the advantages of bilingual education and the choice available to parents. Will you ensure that that strategy is extended to the pre-school sector, like Flying Start, so that the decision is made at the appropriate time? What will you do to ensure that that campaign is more widely advertised? You attended the cross-party group on the Welsh language this morning and I think that it is true to say that some Members had not heard about the Government's marketing campaign, perhaps because no statement has been made in the Chamber.

The First Minister: There was a written statement, if I remember correctly. The media was at the launch—it was not a secret.

Simon Thomas: I accept that, but if there are some Members who have not heard of it, it shows the spadework that remains to be done.

The First Minister: I will ask Caroline in a moment to explain how the campaign works. The aim is to ensure that children between birth and three years of age, or their parents, are captured by this campaign to ensure that the decision is taken at that time. We know that there are children who start in Welsh-medium education and move to English-medium education—a few children—and there are a small number who go the other way. So, it is important that the decision is taken early in the child's life to ensure that they go into Welsh-medium education.

addysg Gymraeg.

[90] **Dr Turner:** Mae ychydig o lefelau i'r ymgyrch hon, a fydd yn ymgyrch dros gyfnod, wrth gwrs. Mae elfen genedlaethol—yn sicr, rwyf wedi gweld rhai o'r posteri o gwmpas Caerdydd dros yr wythnos diwethaf—ac mae targedu lleol hefyd. Mae pum ardal benodol yn cael eu targedu, oherwydd rydym yn ymwybodol bod lleoedd lle nad oes twf wedi bod yn niferoedd y plant saith oed sy'n cael eu hasesu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Felly, mae targedu lleol yn ochrau Fflint, yn Llanelli, ym Merthyr, ac os wyf yn cofio, mae Blaenau Gwent yn un arall. Mae hynny'n golygu bod mwy o sylw mewn rhai ardaloedd nag mewn ardaloedd eraill.

[91] Mae'r ymgyrch hefyd yn ffitio i mewn i'r cynllun Twf, sy'n bodoli ers dros 10 mlynedd bellach. Mae hwnnw'n targedu rhieni cyn i faban gael ei eni—yn gynnar iawn. Mae'n gwneud i bobl feddwl am yr iaith y maent am ei throsglwyddo a sicrhau eu bod yn gwybod am y cyfleoedd sydd ar gael o ran addysg Gymraeg, gan weithio gyda'r mentrau yn lleol a chyda'r Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin. Felly, mae nifer o wahanol elfennau i'r ymgyrch. Mae gwefan hefyd ac arni fwy o wybodaeth. Felly, mae'n ymgyrch genedlaethol, ond mae'n targedu'r ardaloedd lle rydym yn teimlo bod potensial am fwy o dwf.

[92] **Simon Thomas:** Sut y bydd yr ymgyrch yn cydlynu ag ochr arall y rhychwant oedran, lle mae pobl yn dechrau ymwneud â'r gweithlu? Rydym wedi trafod y gwasanaeth sifil, ond mae tystiolaeth gan y comisiynydd iaith i'r pwyllgor hwn yn dweud nad yw'r dilyniant ieithyddol yn parhau y tu hwnt i'r ysgol—rydym wedi trafod hynny—nac i'r gweithle ychwaith, gan nad yw pobl yn manteisio ar y cyfle i gynyddu eu sgiliau yno. Mae'n siŵr bod gennyh staff hyd yn oed yn y gwasanaeth sifil nad ydynt yn defnyddio'r sgiliau sydd ganddynt, er bod cyfleoedd i wneud hynny. A yw hynny'n rhan o'r ymgyrch farchnata hon, ynteu a yw'n rhan o ymgyrch ehangach gan y Llywodraeth i annog y defnydd yn y gweithle?

[93] **Dr Turner:** Mae honno'n elfen wahanol, rwy'n meddwl. Mae'r ymgyrch a

Dr Turner: There are a few levels to this campaign, which will, of course, be conducted over a period of time. There is a national element—I have seen some of the posters around Cardiff over the past week—and there is also local targeting. Five specific areas have been targeted, because we are aware that there are areas where there has been no growth in the number of seven-year-olds assessed through the medium of Welsh. So, there is local targeting in the Flintshire area, in Llanelli, and in Merthyr; Blaenau Gwent is another area, if I remember correctly. That means that there is more coverage in certain areas than in others.

This campaign also fits in with the Twf scheme, which has been around for over 10 years now. That targets parents even before the child is born—very early on. It makes people think about the language that they are going to transfer to that child and ensures that they are aware of the opportunities available in Welsh-medium education, working with the *mentrau iaith* at a local level and with the *Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin*. So, there are many aspects to this campaign. There is also a website with more information. It is a national campaign, but it targets the areas where we believe that there is potential for more growth.

Simon Thomas: How will the campaign co-ordinate with the other end of the age range, when people join the workforce? We have discussed the civil service, but evidence from the language commissioner to this committee said that there is no linguistic continuity beyond the school—we have discussed that—and that it does not continue in the workplace, as people do not take advantage of the opportunity to improve their skills there. I am sure that you even have staff in the civil service who do not use the skills that they have, even though there are opportunities to do so. Is that part of this marketing campaign, or is it part of a wider campaign by the Government to encourage the use of Welsh in the workplace?

Dr Turner: That is a different element, I think. The campaign that we have launched

lansiwyd gennym yn y mis diwethaf yn targedu rhieni ifanc yn benodol. Rydych yn sôn am elfen bwysig, sef beth sy'n digwydd ar ddiwedd y cyfnod ysgol ffurfiol. Mae cymaint o bwyslais wedi bod dros y 15 i 20 mlynedd diwethaf ar addysg a'r system statudol, ond dim ond yn weddol ddiweddar rydym wedi sylweddoli pwysigrwydd addysg bellach—nid addysg uwch yn unig, ond addysg bellach a sgiliau galwedigaethol hefyd.

[94] Bydd safonau yn golygu y bydd ar gyflogwyr sector cyhoeddus yn benodol, ac elfennau o'r sector preifat a'r trydydd sector, angen gweithlu llawer iawn mwy hyblyg gyda mwy o sgiliau i gynnig gwasanaethau yn y Gymraeg o hyn ymlaen. Mae ysgolion yn cynhyrchu siaradwyr Cymraeg rhugl â safon addysg dda, ond yn aml iawn nid ydynt yn cael y cyfle i ddefnyddio'r Gymraeg yn y gweithle. Yn aml, mae gan gyflogwyr siaradwyr Cymraeg ar eu llyfrau, ond efallai nad ydynt yn ymwybodol o hynny. Felly, mae rhywbeth y mae angen inni ei wneud yn wahanol i helpu'r cyrff a'r cyflogwyr hyn ddeall beth sydd ganddynt a beth y mae ysgolion lleol a cholegau lleol yn ei gynhyrchu. Rwy'n meddwl yn aml nad yw cyflogwyr yn ymwybodol o'r hyn sy'n bodoli yn lleol. Nid wyf yn meddwl bod hynny'n golygu cael cyllid ychwanegol o reidrwydd; mae'n fater o feddwl a chynllunio mewn ffordd wahanol.

[95] Yn sicr, mae'r linc rhwng sgiliau, yr economi a chymunedau Cymraeg yn rhywbeth rydym yn edrych arno ar hyn o bryd, a bydd hwn yn un o'r elfennau rydym yn bwriadu eu cynnwys mewn datganiad pellach yn y gwanwyn.

[96] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Un peth rydym yn ei ystyried yw ei bod yn bwysig bod yr iaith yn amlwg. Mae'n bwysig bod y sector preifat yn defnyddio arwyddion dwyieithog a hefyd arwyddion sy'n gywir yn Gymraeg, a rhaid i awdurdodau lleol wneud yr un peth; mae awdurdodau lleol dros y blynyddoedd wedi derbyn arwyddion ffyrdd yn Gymraeg nad ydynt yn iawn. Dylent fod wedi eu rhoi yn ôl, ond dyna ni. Mae'n bwysig bod y Gymraeg yn amlwg a'i bod yn iawn.

over the past month specifically targets young parents. You are talking now about the end of formal education, and what happens at the end of formal schooling. There has been so much emphasis over the past 15 to 20 years on statutory education, but I think that it is only relatively recently that we have realised how important further education is—not just higher education, but higher education and vocational skills, too.

Standards will mean that employers, particularly in the public sector, but also in certain parts of the private sector and the third sector, will need a far more flexible workforce with greater skills in order to provide services through the medium of Welsh. Schools produce fluent Welsh speakers who have a good level of education, but, very often, they do not have the opportunity to use the Welsh language in the workplace. Very often, employers have Welsh speakers on their books, but they are perhaps not aware of that. So, there is something that we need to do differently to assist those organisations and employers to understand the resource that they have in place already and understand what local schools and colleges are producing. I think that it is often the case that employers are unaware of what is available locally. I do not think that that necessarily means additional funding; it is a case of thinking and planning in a different way.

Certainly, that link between skills, the economy and Welsh-speaking communities is something that we are considering at the moment, and this will be one of the elements that we intend to include in a further statement in the spring.

The First Minister: One thing that we are also considering is that it is important that the language is prominent. It is important that the private sector uses bilingual signage and that the Welsh used on the signs is correct, and local authorities must do likewise; local authorities over the years have accepted road signs in Welsh that are not correct. They should have just sent them back, but there we are. It is important that the Welsh language is prominent and correct.

[97] **Simon Thomas:** Sef bod parch yn cael ei ddangos.

Simon Thomas: That is, that respect is shown.

[98] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn union. Hefyd, rwyf am ystyried sut y gallwn sicrhau bod busnesau, yn enwedig y siopau mawr, yn sicrhau bod unrhyw un ar eu staff sy'n siarad Cymraeg yn dangos y ffaith honno, os ydynt yn mo'yn, wrth gwrs. Hyd yn awr, mae rhai siopau wedi bod yn well na'i gilydd, ond rwy'n siŵr bod pobl, os ydynt yn gwybod bod y person sydd ar y *checkout* yn siarad Cymraeg, yn defnyddio'r Gymraeg. Mae rhai yn gwneud hynny, wrth gwrs; mae rhai banciau'n gwneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, fe allwn wneud mwy o hynny er mwyn sicrhau bod pobl yn gallu dod i'r arfer o ymarfer eu Cymraeg pan fyddent mas yn siopa ac yn gwneud y pethau maent yn eu gwneud o ddydd i ddydd. Dyna un o'r pethau yr wyf yn mo'yn ystyried yn y dyfodol er mwyn annog y busnesau hyn, yn enwedig siopau, i sicrhau bod y Gymraeg yn amlwg, nid dim ond ar yr arwyddion, ond hefyd o ran y staff yn siarad ac yn defnyddio'r Gymraeg. Rwy'n ffeindio ym Mhen-y-bont fod pobl yn siarad Cymraeg â fi mewn siop, achos maent yn gwybod fy mod yn siarad Cymraeg, ond, wrth gwrs, nid wyf yn gwybod eu bod nhw'n siarad Cymraeg. Byddai'n neis gwybod eu bod yn siarad Cymraeg er mwyn gallu ei defnyddio. Byddai gwneud hynny, wrth gwrs, yn normaleiddio'r Gymraeg mewn ardal lle nad yw'r Gymraeg wedi bod yn iaith y gymuned ers dros ganrif. Felly, rwyf eisiau ystyried y math o bethau hynny yn y dyfodol hefyd.

The First Minister: Exactly. Also, I want to consider in what way we can ensure that businesses, especially the large shops, can ensure that any Welsh speakers on their staff can show that fact, if they want to, of course. Up till now, some shops have been better than others, but I am sure that if people knew that the person at the checkout spoke Welsh, they would use the Welsh language. Some people do that, of course; some of the banks do that. However, we could do more of that to ensure that people get into the habit of practising their Welsh when they are out shopping and doing the things that they do from day to day. That is one of the things that I want to consider in the future to promote these businesses, especially shops, to ensure that the Welsh language is prominent, not only on signs, but also in terms of the staff speaking and using the Welsh language. I find that in Bridgend people speak Welsh to me in a shop, because they know that I speak Welsh, but, of course, I do not know that they speak Welsh. It would be nice to know that they speak Welsh so that the language could be used. Doing so, of course, would normalise the Welsh language in an area where the Welsh language has not been a community language for over a century. Therefore, I want to consider things like that in the future as well.

[99] **Peter Black:** On the road signs issue, I am told that one of the reasons for that is that when the signs are professionally translated, the translator does not get to proofread the transcription from the translation to the sign. Often, the authority does not actually follow up the translation to make sure that it appears in public as it was translated. That is apparently quite common across local authorities.

[100] I want to turn to the evidence that we have from the Welsh Language Commissioner, who told us that, as you know, there has been a 10% cut in her budget. When she came before us, she told us that there had been no discussion with her, prior to publication of the draft budget, as to why that cut took place and what the Welsh Government understood that she would be able to make savings on to achieve that 10% cut. She told us that she might need to cut corners significantly in 2014-15, while running two regulatory systems. Could you outline the basis for the decision to cut the commissioner's budget by 10% and how you expect her to manage within that restricted budget?

[101] **The First Minister:** We believe that the commissioner can manage within that budget. It is never easy, but we believe that it can be done. Discussions will now take place between officials and the commissioner in order to identify the future with regard to the

budget. That is something that will take place over the next few months.

[102] **Dr Turner:** Un o'r pethau mae'n bwysig inni gofio yw'r ffaith bod y comisiynydd yn annibynnol. Mater iddi hi yw sut i flaenoriaethu a defnyddio ei chyllideb. Fe wnaethom adael iddi wybod yn ystod yr haf beth oedd ein bwriad ni, oherwydd bod cyllidebau mor dynn ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf. Felly, roedd hi'n ymwybodol o'r bwriad ers peth amser.

Dr Turner: One of the things that we need to bear in mind is that the commissioner is independent. It is a matter for her how she prioritises and uses her budget. We informed her during the summer of our intentions, because budgets were so tight for next year. So, she was aware of the intention for some time.

[103] Rydym yn berffaith hapus i drafod gyda'r comisiynydd. Rydym yn cael cyfarfodydd rheolaidd â hi. Rydym wedi bod yn ofalus dros y flwyddyn a hanner diwethaf i beidio â'i holi hi am ormod o fanylion, ond os yw hi'n dymuno trafod manylion y gyllideb, rydym yn berffaith hapus i wneud hynny.

We are more than happy to discuss this with the commissioner. We have regular meetings with her. We have been very careful over the past 18 months not to question her or to go into too much detail, but if she wants to discuss the details of the budget, we are more than happy to do so.

[104] **Peter Black:** Okay. Perhaps there is a difference between being formally and informally informed of the cut. She also told us that she might need to look carefully at the work that is being done by her office to increase the use of the language within the private and third sectors as a result of that cut. Does that give you some concern? If that is the case, how will you be able to reconcile that with her office?

[105] **The First Minister:** We believe that she will be able to continue, even with the budget cut that has had to happen. The office has a number of members of staff, and, in terms of the work that they do, it will be possible to continue to encourage the use of the language in the private and third sectors. It is inevitable that there will need to be belt-tightening in the commissioner's budget; no-one could argue against that. However, it is still a substantial budget—more than £3.5 million, if I remember correctly—that will be there to assist the Welsh language.

[106] **Christine Chapman:** Some other Members want to come in, but we are up against time. Would you be okay to stay for five minutes?

[107] **The First Minister:** Five minutes is fine, yes.

[108] **Christine Chapman:** Right, okay. We will need to be very concise. Mark?

[109] **Mark Isherwood:** There will be published timetables for the introduction of standards under the Welsh Language (Wales) Measure 2011 in terms of the Welsh Government, local government and national parks. What timetable do you propose for other organisations?

[110] **The First Minister:** The standards under the 2011 Measure will be published in draft by the beginning of next year. They will be in place by the end of next year. That is mainly to do with organisations within the public sector. It is important to get those standards in place as a template first, so that they can be rolled out from then on.

10:30

[111] **Mark Isherwood:** How do you respond to the commissioner's concern that the first

phase will exclude health boards, which will create different language regimes between local authorities and health boards?

[112] **The First Minister:** We will need to make sure that the language is operated to the required standard across Wales. Nevertheless, we need to ensure that the standards, when they are published in January, are understood to be the standards that we would expect to be adopted more widely, not just within those organisations that will be directly affected at the beginning.

[113] **Dr Turner:** Roedd angen inni ddechrau yn rhywle wrth greu set newydd o safonau. Mae natur cyfrifoldebau'r cynghorau lleol, y parciau cenedlaethol a Llywodraeth Cymru yn weddol debyg ac mae'r ffordd rydym yn gweithio yn weddol debyg hefyd. Yn achos rhai o'r cyrff eraill, yn arbennig yn y sector iechyd, bydd angen safonau o natur wahanol efallai, o ran y berthynas un-i-un yn y system iechyd. Felly, rydym wedi blaenoriaethu, er mwyn inni gael dechrau gyda set safonol. Yna, byddwn yn ymgynghori a bydd y comisiynydd yn cynnal ymchwiliad yn y flwyddyn newydd. Y comisiynydd sy'n penderfynu wedyn ble mae hi'n mynd ac i ba sectorau. Mae hi wedi rhannu'r rhaglen dreigl ddrafft efo ni ers peth amser. Nid oes rheswm inni ddisgwyl am flwyddyn gyfan cyn dechrau ar waith pellach gyda safonau mwy penodol ar gyfer sectorau eraill. Materion i'r comisiynydd yw'r amseru, dewis y sectorau a'r gwaith o'n cynghori ni. Unwaith inni gael y set gyntaf allan, a bod pawb yn gallu ei weld ac ymateb iddo, ni fydd rheswm pam na allwn ddechrau yn weddol gyflym ar baratoi ar gyfer setiau mwy penodol ar gyfer sectorau eraill.

Dr Turner: There was a need for us to start somewhere in creating a new set of standards. The nature of the responsibilities of the local councils, national parks and the Welsh Government is quite similar and the way that we work is quite similar as well. When it comes to some of the other bodies, particularly in the health sector, they will need standards of a different nature in terms of the one-to-one relationship in the health system. So, we have prioritised, so that we can start with a standardised set. Then, we will be consulting and the commissioner will be holding an inquiry in the new year. The commissioner will decide then where she is going and to which sectors. She has already shared a draft roll-out programme with us. There is no reason for us to wait a whole year before doing more work on more specific standards for other sectors. The timing, selecting the sectors and the work of advising us are matters for the commissioner. Once we have got the first set out, and that everybody can see them and respond to them, there is no reason why we cannot start quite quickly then on preparing further, more specific sets for other sectors.

[114] **Mark Isherwood:** This is my final question. How do you respond to the commissioner's call for the development of standards that will drive and stimulate cultural change in organisations?

[115] **The First Minister:** That is what standards need to do. The whole point of ensuring that there are standards in place is to make sure that that change happens. The commissioner is part of that process and we very much value the work that she is doing, but there is no point having a set of standards that are observed, but not encouraged. The challenge is for the standards, when they are published in draft and final form, to look to drive cultural change within organisations.

[116] **Leighton Andrews:** Rwyf am ofyn cwestiynau am y berthynas rhwng y Llywodraeth a'r comisiynydd. A yw'r cyfrifoldeb ar gyfer hyrwyddo'r iaith yn glir?

Leighton Andrews: I have questions on the relationship between the commissioner and the Welsh Government. Is the responsibility for promoting the Welsh language clear?

[117] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Rwy'n credu ei fod. Mae'n bwysig dros ben bod rôl y

The First Minister: I think that it is. It is very important that the role of the

comisiynydd yn cael ei hystyried yn rôl annibynnol. Byddaf yn cwrdd â'r comisiynydd ddwywaith y flwyddyn, ac mae swyddogion yn cwrdd â'r comisiynydd yn aml iawn. Mae hynny yn rhan o'r cytundeb fframwaith sydd mewn lle ar hyn o bryd. Rôl y comisiynydd yw sicrhau ein bod ni'n cryfhau'r Gymraeg, a hefyd hybu a hwyluso defnydd o'r iaith. Felly, mae'n bwysig dros ben, o ran y pethau rwyf wedi'u dweud heddiw, fod y comisiynydd yn rhan o'r broses, er mwyn sicrhau bod darpariaeth yn effeithiol dros Gymru.

[118] **Leighton Andrews:** Pryd y gallwn ddisgwyl fersiwn derfynol o'r cytundeb fframwaith?

[119] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hynny'n rhywbeth sy'n cael ei ystyried ar hyn o bryd.

[120] **Dr Turner:** Rydym yn edrych eto ar y cytundeb fframwaith ar hyn o bryd, ar ôl blwyddyn a hanner o fodolaeth rôl y comisiynydd. Cafodd y ddogfen wreiddiol ei chytuno yn weddol gynnar ar ôl i rôl y comisiynydd gael ei sefydlu. Gan ein bod bellach wedi cael mwy o amser, rydym yn mynd yn ôl i drafod gyda'r comisiynydd sut mae'r trefniadau'n gweithio ac a oes angen newid y cytundeb. Byddwn i'n sicr yn gobeithio y byddwn ni mewn sefyllfa i gytuno ar y cynnwys hwnnw a'i gyhoeddi yn y flwyddyn newydd—ym mis Ionawr, gobeithio.

[121] **Leighton Andrews:** Pam wnaethoch chi benderfynu adolygu'r cytundeb fframwaith?

[122] **Dr Turner:** Mae nifer o bethau wedi digwydd yn y cyfnod hwnnw. Fe wnaethoch chi ofyn ychydig o funudau yn ôl a yw'r cyfrifoldebau dros hybu a hyrwyddo yn glir. Mae'r cyfrifoldeb hwnnw'n mynd i ddau gyfeiriad. Mae hynny yn cael ei osod allan ym Mesur y Gymraeg a hefyd yn y datganiad y gwnaeth y Gweinidog ar y pryd ym mis Chwefror 2011, a oedd yn amlinellu pwy oedd yn gyfrifol am beth. Felly, rydym wedi trio dilyn y patrwm a gafodd ei osod. Mae hyn yn golygu bod yr elfen gymunedol yn gyfrifoldeb wedi'i ei throsglwyddo o Fwrdd yr Iaith i'r Llywodraeth, ond mae'r elfennau sy'n ymwneud â'r sector breifat, er enghraifft

commissioner should be considered as an independent role. I meet the commissioner twice a year, and officials meet the commissioner very regularly. That is part of the framework agreement that is in place at present. The role of the commissioner is to ensure that we strengthen the Welsh language, and also promote and facilitate its use. So, it is very important that the commissioner should be part of the process, in order to ensure that provision is effective and efficient across Wales.

Leighton Andrews: When can we expect the final version of the framework agreement?

The First Minister: This is something that is being considered at present.

Dr Turner: We are looking again at the framework agreement after 18 months of the existence of the role of commissioner. The original document was agreed at a relatively early stage once the role of commissioner was established. Now that we have had more time, we are returning to it and discussing with the commissioner how arrangements are working and whether any changes need to be made to the agreement. I would certainly hope to be in a position to agree the content of that and to publish it in the new year—in January, I hope.

Leighton Andrews: Why have you decided to review the framework agreement?

Dr Turner: A number of things have happened in that period. You asked a few moments ago whether it is clear who is responsible for promoting and facilitating. That responsibility is twofold. It is set out in the Welsh language Measure and also in the statement that the Minister at that time made in February 2011, which outlined who was responsible for what. So, we have tried to follow the pattern that was set. That means that the community element has transferred from the Welsh Language Board into the Government, but elements related to the private sector, for example the Working Welsh badge, are the responsibility of the

y bathodyn Iaith Gwaith, yn gyfrifoldeb i'r comisiynydd. Rydym hefyd wedi bod yn trafod technoleg. Yn wreiddiol, roedd y comisiynydd yn arwain ar y dechnoleg yn ymwneud â'r gweithle, ond rydym ni wedi gwneud cryn dipyn ar yr elfen gymdeithasol o dechnoleg. Felly, dyma'r amser i edrych eto ar hyn ac i ofyn a yw'r trefniadau hynny yn iawn. A oes angen inni fod yn gliriach ynghylch pwy sy'n arwain ar beth? Sut ydym yn cydweithio? Mae'r comisiynydd yn amlwg yn annibynnol fel rheoleiddiwr, ond pan ddaw i hybu a hyrwyddo, rwy'n meddwl ei bod yn bwysig inni gydweithio a chynllunio ein gweithredoedd ar y cyd.

commissioner. We have also been discussing technology. Originally, the commissioner led on technology that was related to the workplace, but now we are doing a lot more work on social media and social technology. So, it is now the time to look at whether those arrangements are right. Do we need to be clearer as to who leads on what? How are we collaborating? The commissioner is clearly independent as a regulator, but when it comes to promotion and facilitation, then I think that it is important that we collaborate and that we plan our activities jointly.

[123] **Christine Chapman:** Are there any more questions? We have no more questions, First Minister, so I thank you and Caroline Turner for attending this morning. We will send you a transcript of the meeting, so that you can check it for factual accuracy. Thank you for attending.

[124] **The First Minister:** Thank you, Chair. I will respond, of course, to the issues raised by Members that need a response.

10:36

Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42 i Benderfynu Gwahardd y Cyhoedd Motion Under Standing Order 17.42 to Resolve to Exclude the Public

[125] **Christine Chapman:** I move that

the committee resolves to exclude the public from the remainder of the meeting and for items 1 and 2 of next week's meeting in accordance with Standing Order 17.42(vi).

[126] I see that the committee is in agreement.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion agreed.*

[127] Before I close the meeting, the next meeting is on 12 December, when the committee will be hearing evidence from Carl Sargeant, AM, Minister for Housing and Regeneration, on the Housing (Wales) Bill.

*Daeth rhan gyhoeddus y cyfarfod i ben am 10:36.
The public part of the meeting ended at 10:36.*